NN scattering from the dispersive N/D method including leading two-pion exchange

J.A. Oller

Departamento de Física Universidad de Murcia¹

June 20th, 2013

¹Partially funded by MINECO (Spain) and EU, project FPA2010-17806

NN scattering from the dispersive N/D method including leading two-pion exchange

Contents

Outline

- Introduction
- N/D method
 - Elastic waves
 - Coupled waves
- Onclusions

Introduction

NN interaction is important for nuclear matter, neutron stars, nucleosynthesis, nuclear structure, nuclear reactions, etc ...

Application of Chiral Perturbation Theory (ChPT) to *NN* S. Weinberg, PLB **251** (1990) 288; NPB **363** (1991) 3; PLB **295** (1992) 114.

Weinberg's scheme: Calculate the two-nucleon irreducible graphs in ChPT (the *NN* potential V_{NN}) and then solve the Lippmann-Schwinger (LS) equation

$$T_{NN}(\mathbf{p}',\mathbf{p}) = V_{NN}(\mathbf{p}',\mathbf{p}) + \int d\mathbf{p}'' V_{NN}(\mathbf{p}',\mathbf{p}'') \frac{m}{\mathbf{p}^2 - \mathbf{p}''^2 + i\epsilon} T_{NN}(\mathbf{p}'',\mathbf{p})$$

C. Ordóñez, L. Ray and U. van Kolck, PRL **72** (1994) 1982; PRC **53** (1996) 2086.

In 1935 H. Yukawa introduced the pion as the carrier of the strong nuclear force



The pion mass was inferred from the range of strong nuclear forces

This was estimated from the radius of the atomic nucleus Relativistic-Quantum-Mechanical argument

Thanks to ChPT we can calculate TPE and its role in *NN* scattering is also well established N. Kaiser, R. Brockmann and W. Weise, Nucl. Phys. A **625** (1997) 758.

Heisenberg uncertainty principle: $\Delta t \Delta E \geq \hbar$

Relativity: Velocity of light is the Maximum velocity c

$$egin{aligned} \Delta t \Delta E &= rac{\Delta \ell}{c} \Delta E \geq \hbar \ \Delta E &= rac{\hbar c}{\Delta \ell} \end{aligned}$$

 $\Delta\ell\sim 2~\mbox{fm}$ (1 fm = 10⁻¹⁵ m)

$$M_\pi \sim {\hbar c \over 2 ~{
m fm}} \sim 100 ~{
m MeV}$$

 $M_{\pi} = 138 \text{ MeV}$

• A typical three-momentum cut-off $\Lambda \sim 600$ MeV (fine tuned to data) is used in order to regularize the Lippmann-Schwinger equation because chiral potentials are singular. E.g. The tensor part of One-Pion Exchange (OPE) diverges as $1/r^3$ for $r \rightarrow 0$

• NN scattering is nonperturbative: Presence of bound states (deuteron) in ${}^{3}S_{1}$ and anti-bound state in ${}^{1}S_{0}$. Spectroscopic notation ${}^{2S+1}L_{J}$



NN scattering from the dispersive N/D method including leading two-pion exchange

-Nucleon-nucleon interactions

Extreme non-relativistic propagator (or Heavy-Baryon propagator)

 $\frac{1}{q^0 + i\epsilon}$

Non-relativistic propagator

$$\frac{1}{q^0 - \frac{\mathbf{q}^2}{2m} + i\epsilon}$$



"Pinch" singularity The integration contour cannot be deformed NN scattering from the dispersive N/D method including leading two-pion exchange

-Nucleon-nucleon interactions



$$\int dq^0 \, (q^0 - \frac{\mathbf{q}^2}{2m} + i\epsilon)^{-1} (q^0 + \frac{\mathbf{q}^2}{2m} - i\epsilon)^{-1} = -2\pi i \frac{m}{\mathbf{q}^2}$$

• V_{NN} is calculated up to next-to-next-to-next-to-leading order (N^3LO) and applied with great phenomenological success

Entem and Machleidt, PLB **254** (2002) 93; PRC **66** (2002) 014002; PRC **68** (2003) 041001 Epelbaum, Glöckle, Meißner, NPA **637** (1998) 107; **671** (2000) 195; **747** (2005) 362

• On the cut-off dependence

Chiral counterterms introduced in V_{NN} following naive chiral power counting are not enough to reabsorb the dependence on the cut-off when solving the LS equation

Nogga, Timmermans and van Kolck, PRC **72** (2005) 054006 Pavón Valderrama and Arriola, PRC **72** (2005) 054002; **74** (2006) 054001; **74** (2006) 064004 Kaplan, Savage, Wise NPB **478** (1996) 629 Birse, PRC **74** (2006) 014003 ; C.-J. Yang, Elster and Phillips, PRC **80** (2009) 034002; *idem* 044002.

 \triangleright In Nogga *et al.* one counterterm is promoted from higher to lower orders in ${}^{3}P_{0}$, ${}^{3}P_{2}$ and ${}^{3}D_{2}$ and then stable results for $\Lambda < 4$ GeV are obtained.

> Higher order contributions would be treated perturbatively

Pavón Valderrama, PRC **83** (2011) 024003; **84** (2011) 064002 B. Long, C.-J. Yang, PRC **84** (2011) 057001; **85** (2011) 034002; **86** (2012) 024001

• This procedure is **criticized** by Epelbaum and Gegelia, Eur.Phys. J. A41 (2009) 341.

It is not enough to obtain a finite *T*-matrix in the limit $\Lambda \to \infty$ One should absorb all divergences from loops in counterterms To avoid renormalization scheme dependence and violation of low energy theorems when $\Lambda \to \infty$

• Change your LO: Avoid 1/m expansion in nucleon denominators Epelbaum and Gegelia, Phys.Lett.B716,338 (2012) + OPE

Higher orders would be considered perturbatively

└─N/D method

N/D Method

Chew and Mandelstam, Phys. Rev. 119 (1960) 467

A *NN* partial wave amplitude has two type of cuts: Unitarity or Right Hand Cut (RHC)

$$\Im T = \frac{m|\mathbf{p}|}{4\pi}TT^{\dagger} \quad , \ \mathbf{p}^2 > 0 \longrightarrow \Im T^{-1} = -\frac{m|\mathbf{p}|}{4\pi}\mathbb{I}$$

Left Hand Cut (LHC)



└─N/D method





$$T_{J\ell S}(A) = \frac{N_{J\ell S}(A)}{D_{J\ell S}(A)}$$

 $N_{J\ell S}(A)$ has Only LHC $D_{J\ell S}(A)$ has Only RHC

Uncoupled Partial Waves

$$T_{J\ell S}(A) = N_{J\ell S}(A)/D_{J\ell S}(A)$$
$$\Im D_{J\ell S}(A) = -N_{J\ell S}(A)\frac{m\sqrt{A}}{4\pi} , A > 0$$
$$\Im N_{J\ell S}(A) = D_{J\ell S}(A)\Im T_{J\ell S}(A) , A < -M_{\pi}^{2}/4$$
$$A \equiv |\mathbf{p}|^{2}$$

E.g. taking one subtraction in D(A) and N(A)

$$\oint_{C_l} dz \frac{D_{J\ell S}(z)}{(z-A)(z-D)} = 2\pi i \frac{D_{J\ell S}(A) - D_{J\ell S}(D)}{A-D}$$
$$= \int_0^\infty dq^2 \frac{\left[D_{J\ell S}(q^2 + i\epsilon) - D_{J\ell S}(q^2 - i\epsilon)\right]}{(q^2 - A + i\epsilon)(q^2 - D + i\epsilon)}$$

Schwartz's reflection principle:

If f(z) is real along an interval of the real axis and is analytic then: $f(z^*) = f(z)^*$

$$D_{J\ell S}(q^2 + i\epsilon) - D_{J\ell S}(q^2 - i\epsilon) = 2i\Im D(q^2 + i\epsilon)$$

COUPLED SYSTEM OF LINEAR INTEGRAL EQUATIONS

$$D_{J\ell S}(A) = 1 - \frac{A - D}{\pi} \int_0^\infty dq^2 \frac{\rho(q^2) N_{J\ell S}(q^2)}{(q^2 - A)(q^2 - D)}$$
$$N_{J\ell S}(A) = N_{J\ell S}(D) + \frac{A - D}{\pi} \int_{-\infty}^L dk^2 \frac{\Delta_{J\ell S}(k^2) D_{J\ell S}(k^2)}{(k^2 - A)(k^2 - D)}$$

$$L \equiv -\frac{M_{\pi}^2}{4}$$

$$\rho(A) = m\sqrt{A}/4\pi , \ A > 0$$

$$\Delta(A) = \Im T_{J\ell S}(A) , \ A < L$$

NN scattering from the dispersive N/D method including leading two-pion exchange

Uncoupled waves: Formalism

$$D_{J\ell S}(A) = 1 - AN_{J\ell S}(0)\mathbf{g}(\mathbf{A}, \mathbf{0}) + \frac{A}{\pi} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^2 \frac{\Delta_{J\ell S}(k^2) D_{J\ell S}(k^2)}{k^2} \mathbf{g}(\mathbf{A}, \mathbf{k}^2)$$

CHANGE OF VARIABLE:

$$A=\frac{L}{x}, x\in [1,0]$$

$$D_{J\ell S}(\mathbf{x}) = 1 - \frac{L}{x} N_{J\ell S}(0) \mathbf{g}(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{0}) + \frac{L}{\pi x} \int_0^1 dy \frac{\Delta(y) \mathbf{g}(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{y})}{y} D(y)$$

Fredholm Integral Equation of the Second Kind

$$D_{J\ell S}(x) = f_{J\ell S}(x) + \int_0^1 dy K(x, y) D(y)$$
$$K(x, y) = \frac{L}{\pi} \frac{\mathbf{g}(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{y})}{x y} \Delta(y)$$

• Not *L*₂

Not symmetric

We discretize the equation:

$$\begin{split} \mathcal{K}(x,y) &= k_{rs} \left(\frac{r-1}{n} < x \leq \frac{r}{n}, \frac{s-1}{n} < y \leq \frac{s}{n} \right) \\ f(x) &= f_r \left(\frac{r-1}{n} < x \leq \frac{r}{n} \right) \\ \phi(x) &= \phi_r \left(\frac{r-1}{n} < x \leq \frac{r}{n} \right) \\ &\sum_{s=1}^n \left(\delta_{rs} - \frac{1}{n} k_{rs} \right) \phi_s = f_r \end{split}$$

We indeed make use of more efficient numerical methods to calculate integrals !

High-Energy behavior

• Let
$$|D(A)| \leq A^n$$
 for $A \to \infty$

$$egin{aligned} \mathcal{N}(\mathcal{A}) &= \mathcal{T}(\mathcal{A})\mathcal{D}(\mathcal{A}) \ \mathcal{T}(\mathcal{A}) &= rac{\mathcal{S}(\mathcal{A})-1}{2
ho(\mathcal{A})} \ \mathcal{N}(\mathcal{A}) &\leq \mathcal{A}^{n-1/2} \end{aligned}$$

We divide N(A) and D(A) by $(A - C)^m$ with m > n

$$rac{D(A)}{A^m}
ightarrow 0 \;, \; ext{when} \; A
ightarrow \infty$$

 $L < C < 0$

NN scattering from the dispersive N/D method including leading two-pion exchange

Uncoupled waves: Formalism

$$d(A) = \frac{D(A)}{(A - C)^m}$$
$$n(A) = \frac{N(A)}{(A - C)^m}$$

Unsubtracted dispersion relation (DR)

$$d(A) = \sum_{i=1}^{m} \frac{\delta_i}{(A-C)^i} - \frac{1}{\pi} \int_0^\infty dq^2 \frac{\rho(q^2)n(q^2)}{q^2 - A}$$
$$n(A) = \sum_{i=1}^{m} \frac{\nu_i}{(A-C)^i} + \frac{1}{\pi} \int_{-\infty}^L dk^2 \frac{\Delta(k^2)d(k^2)}{k^2 - A}$$

In terms of the original functions D(A) and N(A)

$$D(A) = \sum_{i=1}^{m} \delta_i (A - C)^{m-i} - \frac{(A - C)^m}{\pi} \int_0^\infty dq^2 \frac{\rho(q^2) N(q^2)}{(q^2 - A)(q^2 - C)^m}$$
$$N(A) = \sum_{i=1}^{m} \nu_i (A - C)^{m-i} + \frac{(A - C)^m}{\pi} \int_{-\infty}^L dk^2 \frac{\Delta(k^2) D(k^2)}{(k^2 - A)(k^2 - C)^m}$$

m = 1 is the minimum

Once-subtracted DR for N(A) and D(A)

- C could be taken different in D(A) and N(A)
 - N(A): C = 0
 - D(A): One subtraction at C = 0 and the rest at $C = -M_{\pi}^2$.
 - Normalization: D(0) = 1

 \bullet In connection with ChPT this dispersive method was recently applied to NN scattering in

- LO: M. Albaladejo and J.A. Oller, PRC 84 (2011) 054009; 86 (2011) 034005 employing OPE
- NLO: Z.-H.Guo, G. Ríos, J.A. Oller, arXiv:1305.5790 OPE+leading TPE

The N/D method provides nonperturbative scattering equations that requires an input $\Delta(A)$ that is calculated in perturbation theory

Integrals of infinite extent are convergent by introducing enough number of subtractions

In A. M. Gasparyan, M. F. M. Lutz and E. Epelbaum, arXiv:1212.3057 integrals were truncated \longrightarrow loss of perfect analytical properties and self-control on the number of subtraction constants required.

NN scattering from the dispersive N/D method including leading two-pion exchange

Uncoupled waves: Formalism

△(A) is given by ⁻ⁱ/₂ the discontinuity of T(A) across the LHC:
 ● OPE

- Leading TPE (irreducible)
- Once-iterated OPE

Kaiser, Brockmann and Weise, NPA625(1997)758



 $\Delta(A)$ is finite

$$\lim_{A\to\infty}\Delta(A)\to A$$

For once-subtracted DR:

- D(A) should decrease $1/A^{lpha}$, lpha> 0, for $A
 ightarrow\infty$
- N(A) should decrease as $1/A^{\alpha+rac{1}{2}}$ for $A
 ightarrow\infty$

Uncoupled waves: ¹S₀

¹ S_0 : Once-subtracted DR

$$D(A) = 1 - A\nu_1 g(A, 0) + rac{A}{\pi} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^2 rac{\Delta(k^2) D(k^2)}{k^2} g(A, k^2)$$

Fixed in terms of scattering length: $\nu_1 = -4\pi a_s/m$



$$r_{s} = \frac{m}{2\pi^{2}a_{s}} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^{2} \frac{\Delta(k^{2})D(k^{2})}{(k^{2})^{2}} \left\{ \sqrt{-k^{2}} - \frac{1}{a_{s}} \right\}$$

Correlation between a_s and r_s

 $r_s = 2.64 \, {\rm fm}$

Exp: 2.75 ± 0.05 fm Nijmll: 2.670 fm Arriola, Pavón, nucl-th/0407113 Uncoupled waves: ${}^{1}S_{0}$

$$-\frac{A}{\pi}\int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^{2} \frac{\Delta(k^{2})D(k^{2})}{k^{2}}g(A,k^{2}) + D(A) = 1 + A\frac{4\pi a_{s}}{m}g(A,0)$$

 $D(A) = D_0(A) + a_s D_1(A)$ with $D_{0,1}(A)$ independent of a_s Low-energy correlation:

$$\begin{aligned} r_{s} &= \alpha_{0} + \frac{\alpha_{-1}}{a_{s}} + \frac{\alpha_{-2}}{a_{s}^{2}} , \qquad \alpha_{0} &= \frac{m}{2\pi^{2}} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^{2} \frac{\Delta(k^{2})D_{1}(k^{2})}{(k^{2})^{2}} \sqrt{-k^{2}} \\ \alpha_{0} &= 2.44 \text{ fm} , \\ \alpha_{-1} &= -4.61 \text{ fm}^{2} , \qquad \alpha_{-1} &= \frac{m}{2\pi^{2}} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^{2} \frac{\Delta(k^{2})}{(k^{2})^{2}} \left[D_{0}(k^{2}) \sqrt{-k^{2}} - D_{1}(k^{2}) \right] \\ \alpha_{-2} &= 5.26 \text{ fm}^{3} . \qquad \alpha_{-2} &= -\frac{m}{2\pi^{2}} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^{2} \frac{\Delta(k^{2})D_{0}(k^{2})}{(k^{2})^{2}} \end{aligned}$$

Pavón Valderrama, Ruiz Arriola PRC74(2006)054001: solving a Lippmann-Schwinger equation with V_{NN} that includes OPE+TPE + boundary conditions + orthogonality of wave functions

Uncoupled waves: ${}^{1}S_{0}$



Quantifying contributions to $\Delta(A)$

A typical integral from twice-subtracted DR:

$$\frac{A(A+M_{\pi}^2)}{\pi^2}\int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^2 \frac{\Delta(k^2)D(k^2)}{(k^2)^2}\int_{0}^{\infty} dq^2 \frac{q^2\rho(q^2)}{(q^2-A)(q^2-k^2)(q^2+M_{\pi}^2)}$$

$$D(k^2) \rightarrow 1$$

For that two subtractions at least must be taken for the previous integral to converge

Quantifying contributions to $\Delta(A)$

A typical integral from twice-subtracted DR:

$$\frac{A(A+M_{\pi}^2)}{\pi^2}\int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^2 \frac{\Delta(k^2)}{(k^2)^2}\int_{0}^{\infty} dq^2 \frac{q^2\rho(q^2)}{(q^2-A)(q^2-k^2)(q^2+M_{\pi}^2)}$$

The integral displays the dominant role played by the nearest region in the LHC



NN scattering from the dispersive N/D method including leading two-pion exchange \Box Uncoupled waves: ${}^{3}P_{n}$

³*P*₀: **Once-subtracted DR.** NO FREE PARAMETERS $\nu_1 = 0$ because for a P-wave T(0) = 0 = N(0), D(0) = 1

$$D(A) = 1 - \frac{A}{\pi} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^2 \frac{\Delta(k^2)D(k^2)}{k^2} g(A, k^2) \qquad N(A) = \frac{A}{\pi} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^2 \frac{\Delta(k^2)D(k^2)}{k^2(k^2 - A)}$$



Uncoupled waves: ${}^{3}P_{0}$

Twice-subtracted DR

$$N(A) = A\nu_2 + \frac{A^2}{\pi} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^2 \frac{\Delta(k^2)D(k^2)}{(k^2)^2(k^2 - A)} \qquad \nu_2 = \frac{4\pi a_V}{m} , \ a_V = 0.89 \ M_{\pi}^{-3}$$

$$D(A) = 1 + A\delta_2 - A^2 \nu_2 g(A, 0) + \frac{A^2}{\pi} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^2 \frac{\Delta(k^2) D(k^2)}{(k^2)^2} g(A, k^2)$$



 δ_2 is fitted

$$\delta_2\simeq -0.30~M_\pi^{-2}$$

Quantifying contributions to $\Delta(A)$

A typical integral from twice-subtracted DR:

$$\frac{A(A+M_{\pi}^2)}{\pi^2}\int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^2 \frac{\Delta(k^2)}{(k^2)^2}\int_{0}^{\infty} dq^2 \frac{q^2\rho(q^2)}{(q^2-A)(q^2-k^2)(q^2+M_{\pi}^2)}$$



NN scattering from the dispersive N/D method including leading two-pion exchange

Discussion on LHC and chiral counting

Discussion on LHC and chiral counting

$$\frac{A(A+M_{\pi}^2)}{\pi^2} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^2 \frac{\Delta(k^2)}{(k^2)^2} \int_{0}^{\infty} dq^2 \frac{q^2 \rho(q^2)}{(q^2-A)(q^2-k^2)(q^2+M_{\pi}^2)}$$

- 1) Low-energy enhancement in the integrand $1/(k^2)^2$
- 2) From $-M_{\pi}^2/4$ to $-M_{\pi}^2$ large OPE $\Delta(A)$ OPE dominates the integral.

Typical value of derivative $1/A^2 \rightarrow 16/M_{\pi}^4$ in an interval of length $3/4M_{\pi}^2$ relative change ~ 3 (quite steep function)

3) Rapid convergence pattern at low energies:

$$1\pi \gg 2\pi \gg 3\pi > \ldots > n\pi$$

$$(e^{-M_{\pi}r} \gg e^{-2M_{\pi}r} \gg e^{-3M_{\pi}r} \gg \ldots) \quad r \gg M_{\pi}^{-1}$$

4) Increasing *n* in multi- π ladder: $VGV \cdots VGV$ Three-(*n*-)times iterated OPE gives rise to $3\pi(n\pi)$ cut for $A < -9M_{\pi}^2/4$ ($A < -n^2M_{\pi}^2/4$) \rightarrow Further suppressed Discussion on LHC and chiral counting

5) $A < -M_{\pi}^2$ Numeric enhancement of irreducible TPE

$${}^{3}P_{0}: \ \ \frac{\Delta_{VGV}}{\Delta_{IRR}} \to -\frac{\pi m}{(-A)^{rac{1}{2}}} rac{36}{245} \simeq rac{3M_{\pi}}{(-A)^{rac{1}{2}}} \simeq \mathcal{O}(1)$$

- 5) This numerical enhancement makes *VGV* and Irre-TPE to have similar size.
- 6) For a given nπ-exchange: Higher order corrections. Subleading in the chiral counting → perturbative treatment.
- 8) We advocate for counting in $\Delta(A)$: each iteration GV as $\mathcal{O}(p^2) \sim \text{extra loop in Irre-TPE}$

It would have this numerical enhancement.



¹*P*₁: **Once-subtracted DR**: No free parameters

Twice-Subtracted DR: $a_V = -0.94 \ M_{\pi}^{-3}$



They are the same!

Quantifying contributions to $\Delta(A)$

A typical integral from twice-subtracted DR:

$$\frac{A(A+M_{\pi}^2)}{\pi^2}\int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^2 \frac{\Delta(k^2)}{(k^2)^2}\int_{0}^{\infty} dq^2 \frac{q^2\rho(q^2)}{(q^2-A)(q^2-k^2)(q^2+M_{\pi}^2)}$$



${}^{3}P_{1}$: Once- and Twice-Subtracted DRs No stable solution. It depends on the integration numerical limit Three Time-Subtracted DR

$$D(A) = 1 + \frac{\delta_2 A}{\delta_3} A^2 + (\nu_2 - \nu_3 M_\pi^2) A(A + M_\pi^2)^2 \frac{\partial g(A, -M_\pi^2)}{\partial M_\pi^2}$$

- $\nu_3 A(A + M_\pi^2)^2 g(A, -M_\pi^2) + \frac{A(A + M_\pi^2)^2}{\pi} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^2 \frac{\Delta(k^2) D(k^2)}{(k^2)^3} g(A, k^2, -M_\pi^2; 2)$
 $N(A) = \nu_2 A + \nu_3 A^2 + \frac{A^3}{\pi} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^2 \frac{\Delta(k^2) D(k^2)}{(k^2 - A)(k^2)^3}.$

$$\mathbf{g}(\mathbf{A}, \mathbf{k}^2, \mathbf{C}; \mathbf{n}) = \int_0^\infty dq^2 \frac{\rho(q^2)(q^2)^n}{(q^2 - A)(q^2 - k^2)(q^2 - C)^n}$$

.

Uncoupled waves: ${}^{3}P_{1}$

$$u_2 = rac{4\pi a_V}{m} \;,\; a_V = -0.54 \; M_\pi^{-3}$$

 $\nu_3=0^*$ Fixed. Its effects are reabsorbed in the other free parameters



$$\delta_2$$
, δ_3 are fitted
 $\delta_2 \simeq 2.7 \sim 2.9 \ M_\pi^{-2}$
 $\delta_3 \simeq 0.3 \sim 0.4 \ M_\pi^{-4}$

Highly correlated !
Quantifying contributions to $\Delta(A)$

A typical integral from twice-subtracted DR:

$$\frac{A(A+M_{\pi}^2)}{\pi^2}\int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^2 \frac{\Delta(k^2)}{(k^2)^2}\int_{0}^{\infty} dq^2 \frac{q^2\rho(q^2)}{(q^2-A)(q^2-k^2)(q^2+M_{\pi}^2)}$$



Uncoupled waves: Higher partial waves $\ell \geq 2$

A partial wave should vanish as A^{ℓ} in the limit $A \rightarrow 0^+$ (threshold)

Method: $\ell\textsc{-time-subtracted}\ DR$

$$N(A) = \frac{A^{\ell}}{\pi} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^{2} \frac{\Delta(k^{2}) D_{J\ell S}(k^{2})}{(k^{2})^{\ell} (k^{2} - A)}$$

$$\lim_{A \to 0} N(A) \longrightarrow A^{\ell}$$

$$D(A) = 1 + \sum_{i=1}^{\ell-1} \delta_{i} A^{i} + \frac{A^{\ell}}{\pi} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^{2} \frac{\Delta(k^{2}) D(k^{2})}{(k^{2})^{\ell}} g(A, k^{2})$$

$$\lim_{A \to 0} D(A) \longrightarrow 1 + \mathcal{O}(A)$$
Price to pay: $\ell - 1$ free parameters:
 $\delta_{i} \quad (i = 1, \dots, \ell - 1)$
Tend to become irrelevant as ℓ increases

Uncoupled waves: ${}^{1}D_{2}$

¹ D_2 : Twice-subtracted DR

$$D(A) = 1 + A\delta_2 + \frac{A^2}{\pi} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^2 \frac{\Delta(k^2)D(k^2)}{(k^2)^2} g(A, k^2)$$



Fit $\delta_2 = -0.22 \ M_{\pi}^{-2}$ Magenta line Low-energy resonance. $\delta_2 = 0.1 \ M_{\pi}^{-2}$ Red line

Quantifying contributions to $\Delta(A)$

A typical integral from twice-subtracted DR:

$$\frac{A^2}{\pi^2} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^2 \frac{\Delta(k^2)}{(k^2)^2} \int_{0}^{\infty} dq^2 \frac{\rho(q^2)}{(q^2 - A)(q^2 - k^2)}$$



Uncoupled waves: ${}^{3}D_{2}$

³*D*₂: Twice-subtracted DR

$$D(A) = 1 + A\delta_2 + \frac{A^2}{\pi} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^2 \frac{\Delta(k^2)D(k^2)}{(k^2)^2} g(A, k^2)$$

• $\delta_2 = -0.18~M_\pi^{-2}$ is fitted to data $\sqrt{A} \leq 200~{
m MeV}$



Quantifying contributions to $\Delta(A)$

A typical integral from twice-subtracted DR:

$$\frac{A^2}{\pi^2} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^2 \frac{\Delta(k^2)}{(k^2)^2} \int_{0}^{\infty} dq^2 \frac{\rho(q^2)}{(q^2 - A)(q^2 - k^2)}$$



${}^{1}F_{3}$: Three-time-subtracted DR

$$D(A) = 1 + A\delta_2 + A^2\delta_3 + rac{A^3}{\pi}\int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^2 rac{\Delta(k^2)D(k^2)}{(k^2)^3}g(A,k^2)$$

Principle of maximal smoothness for D(A):

All the $\delta_i = 0$ except δ_ℓ

$$D(0) = 1$$
 , $D^{(n)}(0) = 0$ for $1 \le n \le \ell - 2$, $D^{(\ell-1)}(0) \ne 0$

NN scattering from the dispersive N/D method including leading two-pion exchange \Box Uncoupled waves: ${}^{1}F_{3}$

${}^{1}F_{3}$: Three-time-subtracted DR

$$D(A) = 1 + A\delta_2 + A^2\delta_3 + \frac{A^3}{\pi} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^2 \frac{\Delta(k^2)D(k^2)}{(k^2)^3} g(A, k^2)$$

Principle of maximal smoothness for D(A):

• $\delta_2 = 0^*$; δ_3 is left undetermined by the fit



Quantifying contributions to $\Delta(A)$

A typical integral from three-time-subtracted DR:

$$\frac{A^3}{\pi^2} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^2 \frac{\Delta(k^2)}{(k^2)^3} \int_{0}^{\infty} dq^2 \frac{\rho(q^2)}{(q^2 - A)(q^2 - k^2)}$$



 ${}^{3}F_{3}$: Three-time-subtracted DR

$$D(A) = 1 + A\delta_2 + A^2\delta_3 + \frac{A^3}{\pi} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^2 \frac{\Delta(k^2)D(k^2)}{(k^2)^3} g(A, k^2)$$

• $\delta_2 = 0^*, \, \delta_3$



Red line: Fit $D''(0) \simeq 0.014 \ M_{\pi}^{-4}$ Cyan line: Once-subtracted DR

Quantifying contributions to $\Delta(A)$

A typical integral from three-time-subtracted DR:

$$\frac{A^{3}}{\pi^{2}}\int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^{2} \frac{\Delta(k^{2})}{(k^{2})^{3}}\int_{0}^{\infty} dq^{2} \frac{\rho(q^{2})}{(q^{2}-A)(q^{2}-k^{2})}$$



Uncoupled waves: Summary figure



Uncoupled waves: Summary figure



G-waves:
$$D'(0) = 0$$
, $D''(0) = 0$
 ${}^{1}G_{4} : D^{(3)}(0) \simeq -0.03 M_{\pi}^{-6}$
 ${}^{3}G_{4} : D^{(3)}(0) \simeq -0.04 M_{\pi}^{-6}$
H-waves: $D'(0) = 0$, $D''(0) = 0$, $D^{(3)}(0) = 0$
 ${}^{1}H_{5} : D^{(4)}(0) = -1.0 M_{\pi}^{-8}$
 ${}^{3}H_{5} : D^{(4)}(0) \simeq 2.5 M_{\pi}^{-8}$

Coupled waves

Coupled Waves

$$S_{JIS} = I + i \frac{|\mathbf{p}|m}{4\pi} T$$

Along the RHC $A \ge 0$

$$S_{JIS} \cdot S_{JIS}^{\dagger} = S_{JIS}^{\dagger} \cdot S_{JIS} = I$$

$$S_{JIS} = \begin{pmatrix} \cos 2\epsilon \, e^{i2\delta_1} & i\sin 2\epsilon \, e^{i(\delta_1 + \delta_2)} \\ i\sin 2\epsilon \, e^{i(\delta_1 + \delta_2)} & \cos 2\epsilon \, e^{i2\delta_2} \end{pmatrix} \quad , \quad |\mathbf{p}|^2 \ge 0$$

 ϵ is the mixing angle: i=1 $(\ell=J-1),~i=2$ $(\ell=J+1)$

$$Im \frac{1}{T_{ii}(A)} = -\rho(A) \left[1 + \frac{\frac{1}{2}\sin^2 2\epsilon}{1 - \cos 2\epsilon \cos 2\delta_i} \right]^{-1} \equiv -\nu_{ii}(A)$$
$$Im \frac{1}{T_{12}(A)} = -2\rho(A) \frac{\sin(\delta_1 + \delta_2)}{\sin 2\epsilon} \equiv -\nu_{12}(A)$$

Coupled waves

$$\begin{split} T_{ij}(A) &= \frac{N_{ij}(A)}{D_{ij}(A)} , \quad (ij = 11, \ 12, \ 22) \\ N_{ij}(A) &= N(0)\delta_{\ell_{ij}0} + \frac{A^{\ell_{ij}}}{\pi} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^2 \frac{\Delta_{ij}(k^2)D_{ij}(k^2)}{(k^2)^{\ell_{ij}}(k^2 - A)} \\ D_{ij}(A) &= 1 + \sum_{p=2}^{\ell_{ij}} \delta_p^{(ij)} A(A - C)^{p-2} - \frac{A(A - C)^{\ell_{ij}-1}}{\pi} \int_{0}^{\infty} dq^2 \frac{\nu_{ij}(q^2)N_{ij}(q^2)}{q^2(q^2 - C)^{\ell_{ij}-1}(q^2 - A)} \\ &= 1 + \sum_{p=2}^{\ell_{ij}} \delta_p^{(ij)} A(A - C)^{p-2} + \frac{A(A - C)^{\ell_{ij}-1}}{\pi^2} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^2 \frac{\Delta_{ij}(k^2)D_{ij}(k^2)}{(k^2)_{ij}^\ell} \times \\ &\times \int_{0}^{\infty} dq^2 \frac{\nu_{ij}(q^2)(q^2)^{\ell_{ij}-1}}{(q^2 - A)(q^2 - k^2)(q^2 - C)^{\ell_{ij}-1}} \end{split}$$

 $\lim_{A\to 0^+}\nu_{22}(A)\propto A^{-3/2}$

 $C \neq 0$ to avoid infrared divergences for ij = 22

Coupled waves

$$\delta_{p}^{(ij)} = \frac{(-1)^{p}}{C^{p-1}} \left[\sum_{n=0}^{p-2} \frac{(-1)^{n}}{n!} C^{n} D^{(n)}(C) - 1 \right]$$

Principle of maximal smoothness for D(A): $D_{ij}(C) = 1$, $D^{(p)}(C) = 0$ $1 \le p < n-2$; $D^{(n-2)}_{ij}(C) \ne 0$

One proceeds in a coupled-iterative way:

- We take an input.
- 2 Solve the integral equations and get new $\nu_{ii}(A)$.
- S Repeat the process until convergence is obtained.

Typically,
$$C=-M_\pi^2$$

Coupled waves: ${}^{3}P_{2} - {}^{3}F_{2}$

$${}^{3}P_{2} - {}^{3}F_{2}$$

- ${}^{3}P_{2}$: $\ell_{11} = 1$ Two types of DR are included:
 - Minimal: Once-subtracted DR
 - 2 Twice-subtracted DR

$$u_2 = rac{4\pi \, a_V}{m} \;,\; a_V = 0.0964 \; M_\pi^{-3}$$

- ${}^{3}P_{2} {}^{3}F_{2}$: $\ell_{12} = 2 \rightarrow \text{Twice-subtracted DR}$
- ${}^{3}F_{2}$: $\ell_{22} = 3 \rightarrow$ Three-time-subtracted DR

Results are very similar for $D_{22}'(C) \lesssim -1$ and insensitive to $D_{22}(C)$ fixed to 1^*

NN scattering from the dispersive N/D method including leading two-pion exchange

Coupled waves: ${}^{3}P_{2} - {}^{3}F_{2}$

Phase shifts

From fit to data: $D_{12}(-M_{\pi}^2) = 1.1$



Coupled waves: ${}^{3}P_{2} - {}^{3}F_{2}$



Coupled waves: ${}^{3}P_{2} - {}^{3}F_{2}$

Quantifying contributions to $\Delta(A)$: ${}^{3}P_{2}$





The OPE contribution to Δ(A) for ³P₂ has an anomalously small size compared to the other P-waves
 ³F₂

$$\frac{4(A+M_{\pi}^{2})^{2}}{\pi^{2}}\int_{-\infty}^{L}dk^{2}\frac{\Delta(k^{2})}{(k^{2})^{3}}\int_{0}^{\infty}dq^{2}\frac{\nu_{22}(q^{2})(q^{2})^{2}}{(q^{2}-A)(q^{2}-k^{2})(q^{2}+M_{\pi}^{2})^{2}}$$



Coupled waves: ${}^{3}P_{2} - {}^{3}F_{2}$

•
$${}^{3}P_{2} - {}^{3}F_{2}$$

$$\frac{A(A+M_{\pi}^2)}{\pi^2} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^2 \frac{\Delta(k^2)}{(k^2)^2} \int_{0}^{\infty} dq^2 \frac{\rho(q^2)q^2}{(q^2-A)(q^2-k^2)(q^2+M_{\pi}^2)}$$



Coupled waves: ${}^{3}D_{3} - {}^{3}G_{3}$

$${}^{3}D_{3} - {}^{3}G_{3}$$

•
$${}^{3}D_{2}$$
: $\ell_{11} = 2 \rightarrow \text{Twice-subtracted DR}$

$$D_{11}(C) = 1^*$$

• ${}^3D_3 - {}^3G_3$: $\ell_{12} = 3 \rightarrow$ Three-time-subtracted DR

$$D_{12}'(C)\simeq -0.1~M_{\pi}^{-2}$$

• ${}^3G_3: \ell_{22} = 4 \rightarrow$ Four-time-subtracted DR

$$D_{22}''(C) > 1 \; M_\pi^{-4}$$

Coupled waves: ${}^{3}D_{3} - {}^{3}G_{3}$

Phase shifts



Coupled waves: ${}^{3}D_{3} - {}^{3}G_{3}$

Quantifying contributions to $\Delta(A)$

• ³D₃

$$\frac{A(A+M_{\pi}^2)}{\pi^2} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^2 \frac{\Delta_{11}(k^2)}{(k^2)^2} \int_0^{\infty} dq^2 \frac{\nu_{11}(q^2)q^2}{(q^2-A)(q^2-k^2)(q^2+M_{\pi}^2)}$$



 \Box Coupled waves: ${}^{3}D_{3} - {}^{3}G_{3}$

$$\frac{A(A+M_{\pi}^{3})^{3}}{\pi^{2}}\int_{-\infty}^{L}dk^{2}\frac{\Delta_{22}(k^{2})}{(k^{2})^{4}}\int_{0}^{\infty}dq^{2}\frac{\nu_{22}(q^{2})(q^{2})^{3}}{(q^{2}-A)(q^{2}-k^{2})(q^{2}+M_{\pi}^{2})^{3}}$$



 \Box Coupled waves: ${}^{3}D_{3} - {}^{3}G_{3}$

•
$${}^{3}D_{3} - {}^{3}G_{3}$$

$$\frac{A(A+M_{\pi}^{2})^{2}}{\pi^{2}}\int_{-\infty}^{L}dk^{2}\frac{\Delta_{12}(k^{2})}{(k^{2})^{3}}\int_{0}^{\infty}dq^{2}\frac{\rho(q^{2})(q^{2})^{2}}{(q^{2}-A)(q^{2}-k^{2})(q^{2}+M_{\pi}^{2})^{2}}$$



 \Box Coupled Waves: ${}^{3}S_{1} - {}^{3}D_{1}$

$^{3}S_{1} - ^{3}D_{1}$

- ${}^{3}S_{1}$: The ${}^{3}S_{1}$ scattering length $a_{t} = 5.424$ fm is fixed
- ${}^{3}D_{1}$ and **mixing wave**: The deuteron is located at the same position as it is obtained in ${}^{3}S_{1}$.

$$D_{11}(A) = 1 + A \frac{4\pi a_t}{m} g_{11}(A, 0) + \frac{A}{\pi} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^2 \frac{\Delta_{11}(k^2) D_{11}(k^2)}{k^2} g_{11}(A, k^2)$$

$$g_{11}(A, k^2) = \frac{1}{\pi} \int_{0}^{\infty} dq^2 \frac{\nu_{11}(q^2)}{(q^2 - A)(q^2 - k^2)}$$
For $(i, j = 1 \text{ or } 2)$: $k_D^2 = -E_D(^3S_1)/m$

$$D_{ij}(A) = 1 - \frac{A}{k_D^2} + \frac{A(A - k_D^2)}{\pi} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^2 \frac{\Delta_{ij}(k^2) D_{ij}(k^2)}{k^{2\ell_{ij}}} g_{ij}^d(A, k^2)$$

$$g_{ij}^d(A, k^2) = \frac{1}{\pi} \int_{0}^{\infty} dq^2 \frac{\nu_{ij}(q^2) q^{2(\ell_{ij} - 1)}}{(q^2 - A)(q^2 - k^2)(q^2 - k_D^2)}$$

 \Box Coupled Waves: ${}^{3}S_{1} - {}^{3}D_{1}$

- There is dependence on the input used to solve the integral equations
- We require the maximum stability under changes in the input.

E.g.

$$a_{\epsilon} \equiv \lim_{p \to 0} \frac{\sin \epsilon_1}{p^3} = 1.128 \ M_{\pi}^{-3}|_{experiment}$$

has its minimum value for our best results a_{\epsilon} = 1.1 - 1.14 \ M_{\pi}^{-3}

Coupled Waves: ${}^{3}S_{1} - {}^{3}D_{1}$

Phase Shifts:





Great improvement of the OPE results

▷ **Deuteron binding energy:** $E_D = 2.37$ MeV, experimentally $E_D = 2.22$ MeV, with OPE we obtained $E_D = 1.7$ MeV.

▷ Effective range: $r_t = 1.36 - 1.39$ fm, experimentally $r_t = 1.75$ fm, with OPE we obtained $r_t = 0.46$ fm

$$r_{t} = -\frac{m}{2\pi^{2}a_{t}} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^{2} \frac{\Delta_{11}(k^{2})D_{11}(k^{2})}{(k^{2})^{2}} \left\{ \frac{1}{a_{t}} + \frac{4\pi k^{2}}{m} g_{11}(0,k^{2}) \right\}$$
$$- \frac{8}{m} \int_{0}^{\infty} dq^{2} \frac{\nu_{11}(q^{2}) - \rho(q^{2})}{(q^{2})^{2}}$$
$$g_{11}(0,k^{2}) = \frac{1}{\pi} \int_{0}^{\infty} dq^{2} \frac{\nu_{11}(q^{2})}{q^{2}(q^{2} - k^{2})}$$

More complicated correlation between r_t-a_t than in 1S_0 : $\nu_{11}(A)$ depends nonlinearly on $D_{11}(A)$

Coupled Waves: ${}^{3}S_{1} - {}^{3}D_{1}$

Diagonalizing S-matrix

$$S = \mathcal{O} \left(\begin{array}{cc} S_0 & 0 \\ 0 & S_2 \end{array} \right) \mathcal{O}^{\mathsf{T}}$$

Asymptotic D/S ratio of the deuteron

$$\mathcal{O} = \left(\begin{array}{c} \cos\varepsilon & -\sin\varepsilon\\ \sin\varepsilon & \cos\varepsilon \end{array}\right)$$

Residue of S_0 at the deuteron pole

· · · ·

$$\eta = -\tan \varepsilon$$

 $S_0 = \frac{N_p^2}{\sqrt{-k_D^2} + i\sqrt{A}} + \text{reg.terms}$

Ours results: $\eta = 0.029$, $N_p^2 = 0.73$

Other determinations: Ericson, Rosa-Clot, 1983: $\eta = 0.02741(4)$ Conzett *et al.*, 1979: $\eta = 0.0263(13)$ Nijmegen PWA: $\eta = 0.02543(7)$, $N_p^2 = 0.7830(7)$ fm⁻¹ \Box Coupled Waves: ${}^{3}S_{1} - {}^{3}D_{1}$

- We also tried other possibilities for the integral equations by including more subtractions
- They did not work:
 - Either the coupled-channel iterative process did not converge
 - Or it converged to the uncoupled-wave case
- **Case 1** Fixing from data: a_t and a_ϵ **Case 2** Fixing from data: a_t , r and E_d
- **Case 3** Fixing from data: a_t , r, E_d and a_e

NN scattering from the dispersive N/D method including leading two-pion exchange \Box Coupled Waves: ${}^{3}S_{1} - {}^{3}D_{1}$

Quantifying contributions to $\Delta(A)$

• ${}^{3}S_{1}$

$$\frac{A^2}{\pi^2} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^2 \frac{\Delta_{11}(k^2)}{(k^2)^2} \int_{0}^{\infty} dq^2 \frac{\nu_{11}(q^2)}{(q^2 - A)(q^2 - k^2)}$$



 \Box Coupled Waves: ${}^{3}S_{1} - {}^{3}D_{1}$

• ³D₁

$$\frac{A(A-k_D^2)}{\pi^2} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^2 \frac{\Delta_{22}(k^2)}{(k^2)^2} \int_{0}^{\infty} dq^2 \frac{\nu_{22}(q^2)q^2}{(q^2-A)(q^2-k^2)(q^2-k_D^2)}$$



NN scattering from the dispersive N/D method including leading two-pion exchange

 \Box Coupled Waves: ${}^{3}S_{1} - {}^{3}D_{1}$

•
$${}^{3}S_{1} - {}^{3}D_{1}$$

$$\frac{A(A-k_D^2)}{\pi^2} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^2 \frac{\Delta_{12}(k^2)}{(k^2)^2} \int_{0}^{\infty} dq^2 \frac{\rho(q^2)q^2}{(q^2-A)(q^2-k^2)(q^2-k_D^2)}$$


Coupled waves: Summary figure



Coupled waves: Summary figure



Coupled waves: ${}^{3}F_{4} - {}^{3}H_{4}$

 ${}^{3}F_{4} - {}^{3}H_{4}$

- ${}^{3}F_{4}$: $\ell_{11} = 3 \rightarrow$ Three-time-subtracted DR
- ${}^{3}F_{4} {}^{3}H_{4}$: $\ell_{12} = 4 \rightarrow$ Four-time-subtracted DR
- ${}^{3}G_{3}: \ell_{22} = 5 \rightarrow$ Five-time-subtracted DR does not converge \rightarrow Six-time-subtracted DR

$$D_{22} = 1 + \sum_{p=2}^{6} \delta_p^{(22)} A(A-C)^{p-2} + \frac{A(A-C)^5}{\pi^2} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^2 \frac{\Delta_{22}(k^2) D_{22}(k^2)}{(k^2)^6} g_{22}(A, k^2, C; 5) N_{22}(A) = \nu_6^{(22)} A^5 + \frac{A^6}{\pi} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^2 \frac{\Delta_{22}(k^2) D_{22}(k^2)}{(k^2)^6 (k^2 - A)}$$

 $\nu_{\rm 6}=0.079~M_\pi^{-12}$ predicted from uncoupled once-subtracted DR

 \Box Coupled waves: ${}^{3}F_{4} - {}^{3}H_{4}$

Phase shifts





$$egin{aligned} D_{11}'(\mathcal{C}) &= 0^* \ D_{12}''(\mathcal{C}) &= 0^* \ \delta_6 &= -\mathcal{O}(1) \end{aligned}$$

NN scattering from the dispersive N/D method including leading two-pion exchange \Box Coupled waves: ${}^{3}F_{4} - {}^{3}H_{4}$

Quantifying contributions to $\Delta(A)$



Coupled waves: ${}^{3}G_{5} - {}^{3}I_{5}$

 ${}^{3}G_{5} - {}^{3}I_{5}$

- 3G_5 : $\ell_{11} = 4 \rightarrow$ Four-time-subtracted DR
- ${}^3G_5 {}^3I_5$: $\ell_{12} = 5 \rightarrow$ Five-time-subtracted DR
- ${}^{3}I_{5}: \ell_{22} = 6 \rightarrow \text{Six-time-subtracted DR does not converge} \rightarrow \text{Seven-time-subtracted DR}$

$$D_{22} = 1 + \sum_{p=2}^{7} \delta_{p}^{(22)} A(A-C)^{p-2}$$

+ $\frac{A(A-C)^{6}}{\pi^{2}} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^{2} \frac{\Delta_{22}(k^{2})D_{22}(k^{2})}{(k^{2})^{7}} g_{22}(A,k^{2},C;5)$
 $N_{22}(A) = \nu_{7}^{(22)} A^{6} + \frac{A^{7}}{\pi} \int_{-\infty}^{L} dk^{2} \frac{\Delta_{22}(k^{2})D_{22}(k^{2})}{(k^{2})^{7}(k^{2}-A)}$

 $u_7 = -0.178 \ M_\pi^{-14}$ predicted from uncoupled once-subtracted DR

Coupled waves: ${}^{3}G_{5} - {}^{3}I_{5}$

Phase shifts





 $egin{aligned} D_{11}''(C) &< -0.5 \,\, M_\pi^{-4} \ D_{12}^{(3)}(C) &< -0.5 \,\, M_\pi^{-6} \ \delta_7 &= -\mathcal{O}(1) \end{aligned}$

Coupled waves: ${}^{3}G_{5} - {}^{3}I_{5}$

Quantifying contributions to $\Delta(A)$



Coupled waves: ${}^{3}G_{5} - {}^{3}I_{5}$

Minimum number of free parameter per partial wave:

$^{1}S_{0}$	1	${}^{3}P_{0}$	0	$^{3}S_{1} - ^{3}D_{1}$	1
$^{3}P_{1}$	3	$^{1}P_{1}$	0	${}^{3}P_{2} - {}^{3}F_{2}$	1
$^{1}D_{2}$	0	${}^{3}D_{2}$	1	$^{3}D_{3} - ^{3}G_{3}$	1
$^{1}F_{3}$	0	${}^{3}F_{3}$	1	${}^{3}F_{4} - {}^{3}H_{4}$	1
$^{1}G_{4}$	1	³ G ₄	1	${}^{3}G_{5} - {}^{3}I_{5}$	1
$^{1}H_{5}$	1	${}^{3}H_{5}$	1		

- Conclusions

Conclusions:

- Great improvement of the results from OPE to TPE. Our results typically reproduce data as well or better than pure NLO Weinberg scheme.
- **2** Contributions to D(A), A > 0, from LHC integrals of $\Delta(A)$ are suitable for a chiral expansion:
 - OPE is $\mathcal{O}(p^0)$: Dominant.
 - Once-iterated OPE and irreducible TPE can be booked of the same size: Subleading.
- Solution Adding more pion ladders in reducible *NN* diagrams is suppressed because of its "threshold" $A < -M_{\pi}^2 n^2/4$
- We count iterated and irreducible two-pion loops on the same footing, O(p²). Numerical enhancement of the latter.
- Perturbative treatment of higher order contributions with a fixed number of exchanged pions.

- Conclusions

• This should be further confronted with calculations of $\Delta(A)$ at $\mathcal{O}(p^3)$ and $\mathcal{O}(p^4)$.